Talent & Workforce Development in the Arts

A COLLABORATIVE PROJECT OF HERITAGE WORKS, CULTURESOURCE, AND CREATIVE MANY

ROSEMARY LINARES, PRINCIPAL, CROSS MOVEMENT SOCIAL JUSTICE CONSULTING
Initial Findings from the Collaborative Survey on Talent and Workforce Development in the Creative Industries
Rosemary Linares, Principal, Cross Movement Social Justice Consulting, L3C
June 28, 2018

Introduction
Southeast Michigan is rich and growing in its creative talent and enterprises. To support this growth, Heritage Works, CultureSource, and Creative Many collaborated in a survey project to identify the talent, leadership, and workforce development needs of the creative industries. The findings from this project will help inform the deployment of resources and development of unique programming to address the workforce needs of the arts and culture sector.

The project partners engaged Cross Movement Social Justice Consulting to administer the survey and keep all responses in the strictest confidentiality. The survey was administered from April 6 through May 3, 2018. This summary report includes the results from the survey and will be made available publicly to help guide workforce development programming in the creative sector.

Executive Summary
The information that the project partners collected is extensive and may warrant additional analysis than may published here. For this report, the authors present the aggregated data and also disaggregated certain items based on the nonprofit respondents (25% of respondents). In terms of geographic scope, 77% of respondents work in Wayne County. Three quarters of the nonprofit respondents’ operating budgets $500,000 or less.

Nonprofit organizations are hiring the interns who work for them. Over half of the nonprofit respondents (60%) currently participate in internship, fellowship, or job training programs. In the past three years, half of the nonprofits with these programs (28 organizations) have hired a minimum of 72 interns.

Employers seek candidates who know how to communicate, think critically, and collaborate. The top three skills that all respondents seek from successful candidates are 1) communication, 2) critical thinking/analytical/problem solving, and 3) collaboration

The nonprofit arts and culture workforce will continue the overrepresentation of white employees unless action is taken to change the recruitment and hiring practices that promote candidates who are already located within the networks of those making the hiring decisions. To cultivate a racially diverse arts and culture workforce, nonprofit employers need to broaden and diversify their personal and professional networks or identify alternative ways for recruiting and hiring candidates. Of the nonprofit respondents:

- Half said that the racial composition of their organizations is comprised of 80% or more white employees.
• Over a quarter did not know or commented “none of the above” regarding the racial composition of their organization.
• Only 15 percent said that their organization is comprised of 80% or more Black/African American employees.
• 75% said that they successfully recruit and hire candidates via word of mouth
• 47% strategically target and woo candidates
• 31% stated that they promote internal candidates

Internship programs provide an effective leadership and talent development pipeline for nonprofit hiring. Over the past three years, 28 nonprofit respondents hired at least 72 interns.

Most nonprofits leverage internal professional development opportunities and may want to broaden more formal training for employees. Offering professional development opportunities can serve as a strong incentive for skilled employees, and nonprofits may not remain competitive employers if they only offer internal, less formal types of development.
• 43% of nonprofit respondents offer mentoring/coaching and training opportunities led by internal employees

Overall, nonprofit respondents identified fund development as their primary area of need for talent acquisition. If nonprofit organizations could hire high performing entry level candidates, respondents stated that they would be able to increase their programming, impact, and sustainability, yet cited the lack of funding as a major barrier.

Survey Methodology
Using applied research to gain a deeper understanding of the talent and workforce development needs of the arts and culture sector, this survey was sent to an eclectic mix of representatives of nonprofit organizations, universities, businesses, government, funders, and individual artists. This survey sampling included members of the email lists of the project partners, after going through a manual de-duplication process. The survey was administered via SurveyMonkey over the span of 27 days. CultureSource (CS) provided hard copies for participants at an event, which were manually loaded into SurveyMonkey. A total of 2,251 email invitations were sent, of which 1,611 emails were opened and 464 recipients actually clicked through the survey. The total number of respondents was 380, giving this survey a response rate of 17 percent.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Survey Methodology Table</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Email Invitations</td>
<td>2,251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Responses via Online Survey Link</td>
<td>374</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Responses via Hard Copies of Survey Completed at CS Event</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Respondents</td>
<td>380</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response Rate</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Respondent Profile

1) Classification of Respondent Affiliation, n=377

- Individual Artist: 204 (54%)
- Nonprofit Organization: 93 (25%)
- Business or Company: 26 (7%)
- College or University: 21 (6%)
- Other (please specify): 19 (5%)
- Project with a Fiscal Agent: 7 (2%)
- Foundation: 6 (2%)
- Public Sector Entity: 1 (0%)

2) Respondent Role, n=377

- Artist: 165 (57%)
- Executive Director/President: 3 (2%)
- Other (please specify): 11 (8%)
- Programming and operations: 11 (5%)
- Business owner: 6 (5%)
- Board member: 5 (5%)
- Consultant: 3 (2%)
- Financial department: 2 (2%)
- Development department: 1 (1%)
- Volunteer: 1 (0%)
### Respondent Affiliation's Primary Focus Area within Creative Industries,

\( n=376 \)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Responses</th>
<th>Individual Artists</th>
<th>Nonprofit Organization</th>
<th>Business or Company</th>
<th>College or University</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Artist</td>
<td>186</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board member</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business owner</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consultant</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development department</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive Director/President</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial department</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H.R. department</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Programming and operations</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Volunteer</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (please specify)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

![Graph showing the distribution of primary focus areas within creative industries, with Visual Arts at 52%, Independent Artists at 44%, Community at 40%, Education at 34%, Design at 32%, Film, video, and sound at 24%, Print and publishing at 24%, Music production, distribution, and sales at 18%, Support and advocacy at 15%, Other (please specify) at 14%, Internet broadcasting and publishing at 13%, Television and radio at 12%, Advertising at 10%, Architectural and related at 9%, and Architectural and related at 5%]
# Geographic Location of Respondent Affiliates, n=375

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Geographic Location</th>
<th>Individual Artists</th>
<th>Nonprofit Organization</th>
<th>Business or Company</th>
<th>College or University</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Genesee</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Livingston</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Washtenaw</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (please specify)</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

# Geographic Location of Nonprofit Respondent Affiliates, n=159

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Geographic Location</th>
<th>Nonprofit Respondent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>77%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Washtenaw</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Genesee</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Livingston</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (please specify)</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5)

Operating Budget of Respondents' Affiliated Organizations, n=366

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Budget Range</th>
<th>Individual Artists</th>
<th>Nonprofit Organization</th>
<th>Business or Company</th>
<th>College or University</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Less than $50,000</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between $50,000 to $250,000</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between $250,000 to $500,000</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between $500,000 to $1 million</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$1 million to $5 million</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More than $5 million</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (please specify)</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Nonprofit Respondents' Operating Budget, n=92

- 24% Less than $50,000
- 12% Between $50,000 to $250,000
- 8% Between $250,000 to $500,000
- 5% Between $500,000 to $1 million
- 5% $1 million to $5 million
- 35% More than $5 million

Collaborative Creative Industries Survey Draft Report, June 2018
### Average Numbers by Classification

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Classification</th>
<th>Individual Artists</th>
<th>Nonprofit Organization</th>
<th>Business or Company</th>
<th>College or University</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Full-time employee(s)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>183</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part-time employee(s)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>3,336</td>
<td>167</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seasonal/temporary employee(s)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intern(s)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fellow(s)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apprentice(s)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Volunteer(s)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (please specify)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 80% or More of Staff of Respondents' Affiliated Organizations Identify as the Following: n=164

- 35% White (non-Hispanic)
- 2% Black/African American
- 24% Mixed Race/More than one race or ethnicity
- 9% Not sure
- 9% None of the above
- 9% Not sure
Nonprofit Respondents' 80% or More of Staff of Respondents' Affiliated Organizations Identify as the Following: n=66

- White (non-Hispanic)
- None of the above
- Black/African American
- Mixed Race/More than one race or ethnicity
- Not sure
- Hispanic/Latino(a)/Latinx
- Arab-American
- Asian/Pacific Islander
- Indigenous/Native American/American Indian/Alaskan Native

Need for Talent Acquisition

8)

Areas of Need for Talent Acquisition, n=199 (Including "No Need" Responses)

- Development and Fundraising
- Marketing/Social Media
- Business and Financial Operations
- Administrative
- Governance & Board
- Building or Facility Management
- Programs
- IT
- HR
- Management/Leadership
Primary Areas of Need for Talent Acquisition (Excluding "No Need" Responses)

Nonprofit Respondents' Primary Areas of Need for Talent Acquisition
Narrative Response: What trends do you see influencing the talent needs of your organization in the next 3 years? [n=143 and of that 55 were nonprofit respondents]

Themes from nonprofit respondents:

- More staffing and ability to offer competitive compensation packages (21 comments)
- Need more funding/fundraising capacity (15 comments)
- Better marketing, especially social media (15 comments)
Talent Recruitment

Most Successful Recruitment Methods, n=166

- Word of mouth: 74%
- Strategic targeting and wooing of certain candidates: 33%
- Promotion of internal candidates: 29%
- Professional associations like Michigan: 19%
- Recruitment websites like Indeed or Monster: 8%
- Contracting external recruiters/search firms: 7%
- LinkedIn: 6%
- Other (please specify): 5%

Nonprofit Respondents' Most Successful Recruitment Methods, n=68

- Word of mouth: 75%
- Strategic targeting and wooing of certain candidates: 47%
- Promotion of internal candidates: 31%
- Other (please specify): 26%
- Professional associations like Michigan: 13%
- Recruitment websites like Indeed or Monster: 10%
- Contracting external recruiters/search firms: 10%
- LinkedIn: 4%
Narrative Response: Please explain the biggest challenges your organization faces right now regarding hiring new talent: [n=162 and of that 61 are nonprofit respondents]

Themes from nonprofit respondents:

- Organizations lack necessary funding to hire new employees or offer competitive wages
- Challenge with regard to retention of new hires

Narrative Response: What effective strategies has your organization implemented to attract younger or new employees, volunteers, and/or interns who, once hired by your organization, were prepared and high performing? [n=122 and of that 51 are nonprofit respondents]

Themes from nonprofit respondents:

- Effective recruitment strategies, e.g. positive reputation, offering competitive benefits, waiting for the right candidate (11 comments)
- Recruitment of people from within network, e.g. personal relationships, hiring organizational volunteers or interns (7 comments)
- Outreach and partnerships (6 comments)
- Social media or online platforms like Indeed.com (5 comments)
- Training and mentorship (5 comments)
- Hiring search firm (2 comments)
- Effective local marketing (2 comments)

Desired Candidate Skills & Training

11)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Trends in Past 3 Years Regarding Candidates' Skills When Applying, n=117</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>□ Present more skills and qualifications than required for their positions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ Lack the appropriate skills and qualifications for their positions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ Other (please specify)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ Present adequate skills and qualifications for their positions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Respondents' Preferred Skills for Successful Candidates, n=159

- Communication
- Critical thinking/ Analytical/ Problem solving
- Collaboration
- Creativity
- Self-direction
- Interpersonal/relationship building
- Teamwork
- Technical skills in creative fields
- Leadership
- Project Administration

Skill ratings range from 0 to 8, with 7 being the highest preference.
Desired Training or Academic Background for Entry Level Talent, n=203

Preferred Areas of Study when Hiring Entry Level Staff with Degrees, n=202
Training for Entry Level Employees

Professional Development and Training Opportunities for Entry Level Staff, n=255

- Mentoring/coaching: 36%
- Training opportunities led by internal: 25%
- Other (please specify): 19%
- Conference attendance within Michigan: 18%
- Internships: 17%
- Webinars: 15%
- Not sure: 15%
- Training opportunities led by external trainers: 14%
- Conference attendance outside of the state: 12%
- Not sure: 10%
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Professional Development and Training Opportunities for Entry Level Staff, n=83</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mentoring/coaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training opportunities led by internal employees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conference attendance within Michigan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Webinars</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training opportunities led by external trainers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organization does not provide professional development and training opportunities for entry-level staff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conference attendance outside of the state</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (please specify)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not sure</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Internship, Fellowship, and Job Training Programs

16) Respondents with Intern/Fellow/Job Trainee Programs in Past 3 Years, n=190

- Yes: 52%
- No: 37%
- Not sure/not applicable: 11%

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Individual Artists</th>
<th>Nonprofit Organization</th>
<th>Business or Company</th>
<th>College or University</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not sure/ not applicable</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Items 17 – 24 Pertain to Respondents' Intern/Fellow/Job Trainee Programs

17) Respondents' Intern/Fellow/Job Trainee Programming Components, n=95

- Internal program: 42%
- Partnership with a college or university: 41%
- Partnership with a community-based organization or nonprofit: 26%
- Partnership with a high school: 22%
- None of the above: 17%
- Other (please specify): 11%
- Partnership with a company or business: 8%
Goals of Intern/Fellow/Job Trainee Programs, n=94

- To offer youth with an educational development opportunity: 74%
- To provide youth with credentials to further their careers: 54%
- To grow your organization’s knowledge and capacity to meet: 49%
- To prepare participants for hire by your organization: 34%
- To prepare participants for hire by another organization or company: 26%
- Other (please specify): 26%

Number of Participants in Intern/Fellow/Job Trainee Programs in Past 3 Years, n=96

- None: 2%
- 1: 6%
- 2: 14%
- 3 - 5: 38%
- 5 - 10: 19%
- 10 - 20: 11%
- More than 20: 9%
- Other (please specify): 1%
Number of Interns/Fellows/Job Trainees Hired by Respondent Organizations in Past 3 Years, n=95

Number of Interns/Fellows/Job Trainees Hired by Nonprofit Respondents in Past 3 Years, n=54

Respondent Follow Up

Survey Follow Up, n=102